Hochatown Community Access and Pedestrian Safety Project

Benefit-Cost Analysis Narrative



Executive Summary

The benefit-cost analysis evaluated the impacts of expanding the roadway capacity and implementing new pedestrian and bicyclist improvements along U.S. Route 259 ("US 259") near the town of Hochatown as part of the *Hochatown Community Access and Pedestrian Safety Project* (or, "the Project"). The Project will expand the two-lane undivided highway into a four-lane highway divided by a two-way left turn lane ("TWLTL") and add active transportation improvements, improving the links for residents and tourists to the accommodations and amenities in and around the town of Hochatown. The neighboring Beaver Bend State Park attracts about 6,500 daily visitors to Hochatown and the surrounding areas for accommodations and recreational opportunities.

The Project will add to the infrastructure for bicyclists and pedestrians along US 259, including marked crosswalks, 5' wide sidewalks, and a shared use path. An additional lane in each direction and a TWLTL will be constructed along US 259 for 4.2 miles, providing additional capacity for roadway vehicles while allowing for safer turning movements throughout the corridor. Streetlights will be installed along US 259 to improve visibility for vehicle drivers, pedestrians and bicyclists during low-light conditions. In addition to improving roadway conditions, the Project is expected to encourage existing and new pedestrian and bicyclist users throughout the US 259 corridor to use the new facilities, resulting in safety benefits, facility amenity benefits and the benefits from shifting trips from personal vehicles.

The environmental, design, engineering and construction activities of the Project are assumed to start in 2024 and be completed by 2027 with the first full year of operations in 2028. The analysis period for the Project is 20 years of operations following project completion. The analysis was conducted in compliance with the U.S. DOT *Benefit-Cost Analysis Guidelines for Discretionary Grant Programs* published in November 2024. The methodology of the analysis conforms to U.S. DOT and other federal guidelines regarding benefit-cost analysis and was performed in line with industry standards and best practices.

Executive Summary Matrix

Table ES-1 summarizes the key components of the analysis, describing the baseline status of non-motorized and roadway vehicle travel along the US 259 corridor and the expected impacts of the proposed project improvements.

Table ES-1. Executive Project Summary Matrix

Project Parameters	Description
Current Status / Baseline and Problem to be Addressed	Currently, pedestrians and bicyclists traveling in the US 259 corridor must travel along the two-lane highway without protective infrastructure to continue their journey or reach their destinations. Users experience inadequate protective infrastructure along the busy roadway and at intersections, discouraging non-motorized travel in favor of personal vehicle use. Roadway vehicles experience significant congestion during the peak hours of the day, especially during the summer tourism season, resulting in travel delays and collisions between vehicles.
Change to Baseline Conditions / Alternatives	Baseline: Pedestrians and bicyclists continue to be exposed to the safety risks along the busy two-lane highway. Users will continue to be encouraged to use personal vehicles to complete their trips, instead of walking or biking. Roadway vehicles experience worsening congestion during peak hours and risk of crashes during turning movements.
	Alternative: The Project expands the sidewalk infrastructure for pedestrians along the west side of US 259, improving ADA accessibility and encouraging local walk trips. A shared use path for pedestrians and bicyclists will be built on the east side of US 259, improving accessibility for residents and visitors throughout the corridor. The installation of streetlights improve the feeling of safety and comfort for pedestrians and roadway traffic during low-light conditions. The installation of left turn lanes throughout the corridor will result in a more efficient traffic flow during peak periods and avoided vehicle collisions.
Type of Impacts	Pedestrian Safety Improvements Benefits: The Project includes the installation of marked crosswalks throughout the US 259 corridor. The improvements are expected to reduce the risk of conflicts between pedestrians and vehicles and encourage non-motorized user-trips by creating a safe and comfortable street environment.
	Pedestrian and Bicyclist Facility Amenity Benefits: The Project adds new amenities for pedestrians and bicyclists, including the expansion of the sidewalks, the

Project Parameters	Description			
	construction of a shared use path and the installation of marked crosswalks, along US 259. As a result, users will perceive a higher value per trip.			
	Pedestrian and Bicyclist Health Benefits: The Project is expected to encourage existing and new pedestrian and bicyclist users within the US 259 corridor to use the improved facilities. Based on the reduction in mortality risk associated with physical activity, the increase in adult users is expected to reduce the cost of long-term health risks.			
	Reduction in Vehicle Collisions: The Project is expected to reduce the incidence of future vehicle collisions in the US 259 corridor as the construction of left-turn lanes help roadway traffic users experience reduced risk of crashes from congested roadways and during turning movements.			
	Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings: The Project is expected to reduce the travel time for autos and trucks during the peak period through the installation of left-turn lanes and an additional lane in each direction to facilitate traffic flow. The Project is expected to reduce delays throughout the US 259 corridor.			
	Vehicle Emissions Reduction: The Project is expected to encourage residents and visitors in the Hochatown area to use the improved facilities to complete their trips by walking and bicycling, instead of using a personal vehicle. These avoided vehicle-trips reduce the generation of vehicle emissions.			
	Residual Value: The proposed project improvements in the US 259 corridor are expected to have a useful life of at least 30 years, representing a long-term investment in the Hochatown area. The analysis monetizes the useful life of the capital investment remaining at the end of the 20-year analysis period.			

Summary of Benefit-Cost Analysis Results

The benefit-cost analysis evaluates and monetizes the social benefits and costs of the Project over a four-year design and construction period and a 20-year operations period. The construction period of the Project is expected to last from 2024 to 2027; it includes environmental planning, preliminary engineering, design, right-of-way acquisition, and construction. The analysis period of the Project is, following the completion of construction, from 2028 to 2047. The analysis period evaluates the user and social benefits of the proposed project improvements in the project area. The benefits and costs evaluated in the analysis are calculated in 2023 constant dollars and their present value is calculated using a 3.1 percent discount rate, per U.S. DOT BCA guidance; the value of CO₂ emissions are discounted at a rate of 2 percent.¹

Costs

The total capital cost of the Project is expected to be \$68.2 million in year-of-expenditure dollars. The construction costs for the Project represent the estimated previously incurred and future costs for environmental planning, preliminary engineering, design, and construction of the proposed project improvements based on the known concept parameters and schedule. When deflating from year-of-expenditure dollars, assuming an annual escalation rate of 4.0 percent from 2024 to 2027, the capital costs are calculated to be \$60.8 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. At a 3.1 percent discount rate, the capital costs would be \$55.1 million in 2023 dollars. The capital costs by year are summarized below in Table ES-2.

Table ES-2. Project Cost by Year (in millions of dollars)

Cost Category	2024	2025	2026	2027	Total
Year-of-expenditure dollars					
Environmental, Design and Engineering	\$1.1	\$0.8	-	-	\$1.9
Construction	_	-	\$44.2	\$22.1	\$66.3
Total	\$1.1	\$0.8	\$44.2	\$22.1	\$68.2

¹ U.S. Department of Transportation, Benefit-Cost Analysis Guidance for Discretionary Grant Programs, November 2024

Cost Category	2024	2025	2026	2027	Total
Adjusted constant 2023 dollars					
Environmental, Design and Engineering	\$1.1	\$0.8	-	-	\$1.9
Construction	-	-	\$39.8	\$19.1	\$59.0
Total	\$1.1	\$0.8	\$39.8	\$19.1	\$60.8

Note: Values of line items may not up to totals due to rounding.

The annual maintenance costs for all proposed project improvements are estimated to be \$590,000 in 2023 dollars. As a lifecycle cost analysis has not been completed for the project elements, the annual maintenance costs are assumed to represent a conservative estimate of additional maintenance represented as one percent of total construction costs; the improvements would be covered by currently planned levels of maintenance. Over the 20-year analysis period, the total maintenance costs for the project improvements are estimated to be \$11.8 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars, or \$7.7 million when discounted at 3.1 percent. The annual operations and maintenance costs are summarized below in Table ES-3.

Table ES-3. Annual Operations and Maintenance Costs (in undiscounted 2023 dollars)

	No Build Scenario	Build Scenario
Total	-	\$590,000

Benefits

The Project is expected to improve the facilities for pedestrians and bicyclists and alleviate the congested conditions for vehicle traffic in the US 259 corridor. The improvement of the active transportation infrastructure and the expansion of the roadway capacity will provide a more enjoyable and safe experience for all users, while reducing journey time delay and injuries and fatalities from future crashes. Existing and new pedestrians and bicyclist users in the Hochatown area around the improved facilities are expected to enjoy its benefits; they will include adult commuter and adult and child recreational users. With planned development of additional tourist accommodations and amenities around Hochatown, existing and new residents and visitors are expected to increase their demand on pedestrian and bicyclist infrastructure. Over the 20-year analysis period, the monetized impacts include the following:

Pedestrian and Bicyclist Benefits

The improvement of the sidewalk and bicyclist infrastructure provides numerous benefits for existing and new pedestrian and bicyclist users within a catchment area of 3/8 mile and one mile, respectively, around US 259. Marked crosswalks installed throughout the corridor are expected to reduce the risk of incidents between pedestrians and roadway traffic, while the sidewalks and shared use path provide a safer alternative pathway for pedestrians and cyclists currently traveling through the Hochatown area.

Roadway Traffic Benefits

Auto and truck traffic in the US 259 corridor is expected to experience improved traffic flow and reduced conflicts on the roadway due to the increase in roadway capacity and the construction of the TWLTL. The modeled traffic conditions are calculated from on traffic count data of US 259 and a Level of Service (LOS) analysis based on evaluating the daily average volume/capacity ratio using the *Highway Capacity Manual*. Due to the magnitude of traffic attributed to visitors relative to local trips, the analysis evaluates traffic impacts during the workweek and the weekend for the summer season and the off-season months. Evaluating the average daily traffic conditions in the corridor with and without the project improvements illustrates the benefits to auto and truck traffic.

Asset Useful Life and Residual Value

The analysis assumes a useful life of at least 30 years for the proposed improvements, signifying a significant capital investment for the Hochatown area. The residual value measures the remaining value of the capital investment after the first 20 years of straight-line depreciation at the end of the analysis period.

² Krizek, et al, NCHRP Report 552: Guidelines for Analysis of Investments in Bicycle Facilities, pg. 38, Transportation Research Board, 2006

Benefit-Cost Analysis Results

The total benefits generated from the project improvements within the analysis period are calculated to be \$71.1 million in discounted 2023 dollars. The total capital costs, including environmental planning, preliminary engineering, design and construction, are calculated to be \$55.1 million in discounted 2023 dollars. The difference of the discounted benefits and costs equals a net present value of \$16.0 million in discounted 2023 dollars, resulting in a benefit-cost ratio (BCR) of 1.29. Table ES-4 below summarizes the results of the base analysis for the Project by benefit category.

Table ES-4. BCA Summary Results (in 2023 dollars)

BCA Metric	Monetized Value			
	Undiscounted	Discounted		
Total Benefits	\$117,394,000	\$71,053,000		
Bicycle and Pedestrian Safety and Facility Benefits	\$4,929,000	\$3,215,000		
Bicycle and Pedestrian Health Benefits	\$9,326,000	\$6,083,000		
Bicycle Travel Time Savings	\$866,000	\$565,000		
Reduction in Roadway Crashes	\$60,075,000	\$39,188,000		
Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings	\$33,475,000	\$19,760,000		
Vehicle Emissions Reduction	\$860,000	\$488,000		
Residual Value	\$19,654,000	\$9,446,000		
Change in O&M Costs	(\$11,792,000)	(\$7,692,000)		
Total Capital Costs	\$60,839,000	\$55,075,000		
Net Present Value	\$56,555,000	\$15,978,000		
Benefit-Cost Ratio	1.93	1.29		

Contents

1.	Intro	oduction
	1.1	BCA Framework
	1.2	Report Contents
2.	Proj	ect Overview2
	2.1	Description
	2.2	General Assumptions
	2.3	"No Build" and "Build" Scenario Comparison
3.	Proj	ect Costs
	3.1	Project Capital Costs
	3.2	Project Operations and Maintenance Costs
4.	Proj	ect Impacts
	4.1	Bicyclist and Pedestrian Trip Projections
	4.2	Bicyclist and Pedestrian Benefits
		4.2.1 Pedestrian Safety Improvements Benefits
		4.2.2 Pedestrian Facility Benefits6
		4.2.3 Bicycle Facility Benefits
		4.2.4 Bicycle and Pedestrian Health Benefits
		4.2.5 Bicyclist Travel Time Savings
	4.3	Reduction in Crashes Involving Roadway Vehicles
	4.4	Auto and Truck Traffic Benefits
		4.4.1 Vehicle Emissions Reduction
	4.5	Residual Value10
5.	Bene	fit-Cost Analysis Results10
	5.1	Evaluation Measures
	5.2	BCA Results

Tables

Table 1: General Assumptions	2
Table 2: Capital Expenditures by Category and Year (in dollars)	3
Table 3: Annual Operations and Maintenance Costs (in undiscounted 2023 dollars)	
Table 4: Population and Demographic Data (Residents and Tourists), Town of Hochatown, 2023	
Table 5: Projected Pedestrian and Bicycle User-Trips in Project Area	
Table 6: Economic Value of Pedestrian Safety Improvements on US 259	
Table 7: Pedestrian Safety Improvement Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	6
Table 8: Economic Value of Induced Person-Miles by Pedestrians in US 259 Corridor	6
Table 9: Pedestrian Facility Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	6
Table 10: Economic Value of Increase in Person-Miles by Bicyclists in Project Area	6
Table 11: Bicyclist Facility Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	7
Table 12: Economic Value of Health Benefits for Pedestrians and Bicyclists in Project Area	
Table 13: Pedestrian and Bicyclist Health Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	7
Table 14: Assumptions about Conditions for Bicyclists in Project Area	7
Table 15: Bicyclist Travel Time Savings Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	8
Table 16: Crash History for Vehicles in Project Area (2012 to 2021)	
Table 17: Value of Avoided Crashes Involving Roadway Vehicles (in 2023 dollars)	8
Table 18: Projected Annual Vehicle-Hours Traveled in Project Area	9
Table 19: Value of Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings (in 2023 dollars)	9
Table 20: Avoided Vehicle Emissions in Project Area (in metric tons)	9
Table 21: Avoided Vehicle Emissions Benefits (in 2023 dollars)	10
Table 22: Residual Value (in 2023 dollars)	
Table 23: Summary of Benefit-Cost Analysis (in 2023 dollars)	10

1. Introduction

The benefit-cost analysis (BCA) evaluates the Oklahoma Department of Transportation's proposed *Hochatown Community Access and Pedestrian Safety Project* (or, "the Project"), details the methodology and assumptions used to calculate benefits and costs, summarizes project benefits, and details project costs. The BCA is a requirement of the FY2025 Better Utilizing Investments to Leverage Development (BUILD) discretionary grant program administered by the U.S. Department of Transportation (U.S. DOT).

1.1 BCA Framework

A BCA is an evaluation framework to assess the economic advantages (benefits) and disadvantages (costs) of an investment alternative. Benefits and costs are broadly defined and are quantified in monetary terms to the extent possible. The overall goal of a BCA is to assess whether the expected benefits of a project justify the costs from a national perspective. A BCA framework attempts to capture the net welfare change created by a project. It includes cost savings and increases in welfare (benefits), disbenefits where costs can be identified (e.g., project capital costs), and welfare reductions where some groups are expected to be made worse off because of the proposed project.

The BCA framework involves defining a Base Case or "No Build" Case, which is compared to the "Build" Case, where the grant request is awarded, and the project is built as proposed. The BCA assesses the incremental difference between the No Build Case and the Build Case, which represents the net change in welfare. BCAs are forward-looking exercises which seek to assess the incremental change in welfare over a project life cycle. The importance of future welfare changes is determined through discounting, which is meant to reflect both the opportunity cost of capital as well as the societal preference for the present.

The analysis was conducted in accordance with the benefit-cost methodology as recommended by the U.S. DOT in the *Benefit-Cost Analysis Guidance for Discretionary Grant Programs* published in November 2024. This methodology includes the following analytical assumptions:

- Defining existing and future conditions under a No Build scenario and Build scenario;
- Estimating benefits and costs during project construction and operation, including 20 years of operations beyond the Project completion when benefits accrue;
- Using U.S. DOT recommended monetized values for travel time savings, vehicle operating cost savings, pedestrian and bicyclist health benefits and amenities, and emissions, while relying on best practices for monetization of other benefits:
- Presenting dollar values in real 2023 dollars. In instances where cost estimates and benefits valuations are expressed in historical or future dollar years, using an appropriate inflation rate to adjust the values;
- Discounting future benefits and costs with a real discount rate of 3.1 percent; a discount rate of 2 percent is applied to the value of CO₂ emissions.

1.2 Report Contents

The Report illustrates the methodology, assumptions and inputs used in the BCA and an evaluation of its results. Section 2 provides an explanation of the BCA methodology and a description of the project. Section 3 provides an explanation of the project costs. Section 4 provides an outline of the calculation of the benefit categories. Section 5 outlines the summary results of the BCA.

2. Project Overview

2.1 Description

With the planned development of tourist accommodations and amenities in and around the town of Hochatown, there is an urgent need to develop infrastructure to support the reliable and safe access for pedestrian, bicyclists, and roadway users. Hochatown is home to approximately 250 residents; however, on any given weekend, during holidays, or seasonally, the town hosts more than 30,000 people. In 2021, Beavers Bend State Park reported approximately 2.2 million visitors, a daily average of 6,500 people, making it the most visited state park in Oklahoma. Because of the influx of visitors, congestion and associated safety challenges along US-259 are becoming more frequent and are expected to worsen in the foreseeable future.

The existing US-259 within the Project area contains a two-lane undivided roadway with limited shoulder widths and stormwater conveyed through roadside ditches. There are only limited left or right turning lanes, but no existing bicycle or pedestrian facilities. The highway also provides access to over 100 residential and commercial driveways. The Project will improve vehicular movements, enhance overall safety, and provide a reliable infrastructure investment in a rural community that is often overlooked.

2.2 General Assumptions

The BCA requires a number of general assumptions that guide the overall analysis, presented below in Table 1.

Table 1: General Assumptions

Assumption	Value
Base Year Dollars	2024
Capital Cost Adjustment	YOE dollars converted to 2023 dollars using an inflation adjustment factor of 0.9786 (U.S. DOT Guidance)
Real Discount Rate	3.1 percent, excluding 2 percent for CO ₂ emissions (U.S. DOT BCA guidance and OMB Circular A-94)
Environmental/Design/Construction Start Date	2024
Environmental/Design/Construction End Date	2027
Project Opening	2028
End of Analysis Period	2047
Operations Period	20 years (post-construction)

2.3 "No Build" and "Build" Scenario Comparison

The BCA assesses whether a proposed infrastructure investment is economically viable by comparing the quantified benefits to the expected costs of both the Build and No Build/Base Case. Benefits/ disbenefits are estimated through changes in user costs and impacts on the wider community with the project. Net project impacts are measured by comparing benefits to (a) capital costs and (b) ongoing operational expenditures for both the Build and No Build.

The No Build assumes the existing traffic conditions in the US 259 corridor remain without any improvement. Planned development in the Hochatown area increases the demand for the sparse pedestrian infrastructure and roadway capacity, creating conflict points between pedestrians and roadway users. Bicyclists and pedestrians will continue to complete their trips on constrained sidewalks and a busy highway without protective infrastructure, presenting continued safety risk to users and discouraging trips by walking and biking. The current roadway geometry will continue to perform at constrained levels, resulting in growing roadway congestion and crash risk. Pedestrians trying to access the Hochatown area will complete their trip using inadequate pedestrian sidewalk and intersection infrastructure. The rate of crashes experienced by vehicle users in the US 259 corridor will continue at historical levels. Residents within the project area will continue to utilize their current choice of mode of travel to complete their trips.

The Build Case assumes the construction of the additional roadway capacity and pedestrian and bicyclist infrastructure in the US 259 corridor will be completed, encouraging residents in the project area to walk and/or bike

to complete their trips. The planned developments in the Hochatown area will increase the attraction to visitors. The installation of marked crosswalks, sidewalks and a shared use path improves the mobility and safety of residents and visitors; installation of streetlights improves safety and comfort during low-light conditions. Enhancements in the roadway geometry improve the flow of traffic in the corridor, managing intersection delay and reducing the risk of vehicle crashes.

3. Project Costs

The expected costs associated with the Project include the capital expenditures for the planning, engineering and construction of the Project and the change in annual operations and maintenance costs for maintaining the operationality of the proposed improvements. Previously expended costs related to the Project have been included in the analysis.

3.1 Project Capital Costs

The total capital cost of the Project is expected to be \$68.2 million in year-of-expenditure dollars. The construction costs for the Project represent the estimated previously incurred and future costs for environmental planning, preliminary engineering, design, and construction of the proposed project improvements based on the known concept parameters and schedule. When deflating from year-of-expenditure dollars, assuming an annual escalation rate of 4.0 percent from 2024 to 2027, the capital costs are calculated to be \$60.8 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. At a 3.1 percent discount rate, the capital costs would be \$55.1 million in 2023 dollars. Table 2 shows the breakdown of capital expenditures by cost category and year in year-of-expenditure dollars and constant 2023 dollars.

Table 2: Capital Expenditures by Category and Year (in dollars)

Cost Category	2024	2025	2026	2027	Total
Year-of-expenditure dollars					
Environmental, Design and Engineering	\$1.1	\$0.8	-	-	\$1.9
Construction	-	-	\$44.2	\$22.1	\$66.3
Total	\$1.1	\$0.8	\$44.2	\$22.1	\$68.2
Adjusted constant 2023 dollars				<u>.</u>	
Environmental, Design and Engineering	\$1.1	\$0.8	-	-	\$1.9
Construction	-	-	\$39.8	\$19.1	\$59.0
Total	\$1.1	\$0.8	\$39.8	\$19.1	\$60.8

Note: Values of line items may not up to totals due to rounding. *Includes the value of previously expended costs.

3.2 Project Operations and Maintenance Costs

The annual maintenance costs for all proposed project improvements are estimated to be \$590,000 in 2023 dollars. As a lifecycle cost analysis has not been completed for the project elements, the annual maintenance costs are assumed to represent a conservative estimate of additional maintenance represented as one percent of total construction costs; the improvements would be covered by currently planned levels of maintenance. Over the 20-year analysis period, the total maintenance costs for the project improvements are estimated to be \$11.8 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars, or \$7.7 million when discounted at 3.1 percent. The annual operations and maintenance costs are summarized below in Table 3.

Table 3: Annual Operations and Maintenance Costs (in undiscounted 2023 dollars)

	No Build Scenario	Build Scenario
Total	-	\$590,000

4. **Project Impacts**

The Project is expected to result in the following impacts to existing and new pedestrian and bicyclist users and roadway traffic users in the US 259 corridor:

- Pedestrian Safety Improvements Benefits;
- Bicycle and Pedestrian Facility Benefits;
- Bicycle and Pedestrian Health Benefits;
- Reduction in Roadway Crashes;
- Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings;
- Vehicle Emissions Reduction; and,
- Residual Value

The quantifying of these benefits is based on a projection of future existing and new users related to their proximity to improved pedestrian and bicyclist facilities and the standardized economic value of those improvements, based on the U.S. DOT *Benefit-Cost Analysis Guidance for Discretionary Grant Programs* published in November 2024.

4.1 Bicyclist and Pedestrian Trip Projections

The analysis projects the number of current and future pedestrian and bicyclist trips in the project area based on the methodology outlined in *NCHRP Report 552 Guidelines for Analysis of Investments in Bicycle Facilities.* ³ The methodology estimates the number of existing and induced adult and child cyclists and pedestrians in the areas around a new facility based on the existing commute share and their relative distance from the facility. Using multipliers measuring the likelihood for a resident to use the facility, the percentage of existing and new pedestrian and bicyclist users from the local population can be derived based on their proximity. Demographic and population data from the Hochatown CDP define the potential population of existing and induced users; the data is extracted from the American Community Survey published by the Census Bureau. The expected population of residents and visitors in Hochatown and their characteristics identified for the analysis are shown below in Table 4.

Table 4: Population and Demographic Data (Residents and Tourists), Town of Hochatown, 2023

	Population		Commu	te Share ¹	
	Adults	Children	Employed	Bike	Walk
Total / Average	5,686	820	3,221	1.1%	2.9%

(1) The analysis uses the commute share for walking and biking for the state of Oklahoma; the relatively high ratio of visitors to residents is expected to substantially affect the likely share of walking and biking trips. The calculation of the employed population and the commute share by mode is expected to illustrate the likelihood of tourists to travel by walking or biking while in the project area.

Using the demographic and population for Hochatown CDP, the analysis calculates the population density and commute share by mode within a buffer zone around the new facility. The analysis discerns between the adult and child populations in the project area due to differences in their trip purposes (commute and recreational use), participation in activities and the allocation of benefits to each population. Due to the high ratio of visitors to residents, the analysis assumes the population to remain constant into the future to account for the year-to-year fluctuations in the visitor population.

The buffer zone identifies the Project's catchment area for existing and induced users; bicycle users within one mile of the facility and pedestrians within 3/8 mile of the facility would be likely to use the facility. Based on the average trip distance of 2.38 miles for bicyclists and 0.86 miles for pedestrians defined in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents, the utilization of the facility by users in the project area is estimated based on the location of the access points and the length of the facility. With these assumptions, the number of existing and induced trips and person-

³ Krizek et al, "NCHRP Report 552: Guidelines for Analysis of Investments in Bicycle Facilities", 2006, Transportation Research Board, https://www.trb.org/Main/Blurbs/157244.aspx

miles traveled by pedestrians and bicyclists in the project area can be projected under current and future conditions, shown in Table 5 for the current estimate, project opening year and last analysis year.

Table 5: Pro	jected Pedestrian	and Bicvcle User-	Trips in Project Area

Heav Denulation Dy Mode	2024	2028	2047	
User Population By Mode	2024	(Opening Year)	(Last Analysis Year)	
Existing Annual Pedestrian-Trips	17,700	17,700	17,700	
Existing Annual Bicycle-Trips	43,500	43,500	43,500	
Induced Annual Pedestrian-Trips	-	18,900	18,900	
Induced Annual Bicycle-Trips	-	41,500	41,500	

4.2 Bicyclist and Pedestrian Benefits

The calculation of benefits to bicyclists and pedestrians is based on the projected user-trips and person-miles by mode and the standardized values for benefits related to facilities and the reduction of mortality risk. The benefits from a new bicycle facility applies to adult and child users, while the reduction in mortality risk applies only to adult users between the ages of 20 to 64. Based on the characteristics of user populations and travel mode within the project area, the analysis evaluates the changes in user-trips and person-miles traveled to most precisely attribute benefits to the users of the Project. The length of the pedestrian infrastructure improvements in the US 259 corridor is measured at 1.0 miles, while the shared use path is measured at 1.8 miles.

4.2.1 Pedestrian Safety Improvements Benefits

The analysis calculates the benefit of safety improvements for pedestrians in the US 259 corridor by applying the standardized economic value per person-trip for "Install Marked-Crosswalk on Roadway with Volumes Greater Than 10,000 ADT" to the projected volumes of pedestrian users, based on the definitions for pedestrian infrastructure in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. In the year 2023, the vehicle ADTs traveling north- and southbound on US 259 were measured at 11,100, meeting the requirements for the identified safety improvement. The analysis assumes the baseline condition of the existing infrastructure includes travel on street-level infrastructure without additional improvements for pedestrians. The improvements in the US 259 corridor include the following:

 New marked crosswalks will be installed at the intersections of Stevens Gap Road and SH-259A North and South

In addition to the new marked crosswalks, the Project will be replacing the temporary traffic lighting at the intersection of Stevens Gap Road and SH-259A North and South with permanent systems. While the installation of the permanent traffic lights ensures pedestrian users will continue to enjoy the benefits of safer crossings, the analysis assumes existing users already benefits from those improvements. The calculated benefits are based on the projected person-trips (refer to Table 5) using the facility. The economic value per person-trip for the proposed pedestrian infrastructure is \$0.21 (Marked Crosswalk) per person-trip generated by the Project above baseline conditions.

Table 6: Economic Value of Pedestrian Safety Improvements on US 259

	Total Annual Person-Trips		Value of Pedestrian Safety Benefits (2023\$)	
	2028	2047	2028	2047
Pedestrian Safety Improvement Benefits by Year	31,900	31,900	\$7,000	\$7,000

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of pedestrian safety improvement benefits is calculated to be \$0.3 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of pedestrian facility benefits is calculated to be \$0.2 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 7 summarizes the monetized value of safety improvements for pedestrians.

Table 7: Pedestrian Safety Improvement Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$251,000	\$164,000

4.2.2 Pedestrian Facility Benefits

The analysis calculates the facility benefits related to the proposed project improvements in the US 259 corridor by applying the standardized economic value per person-mile for an "Expanded Sidewalk" with an additional width of 5 feet on both sides of each roadway, based on the definitions for pedestrian infrastructure in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. The improved infrastructure will consist of 10-foot-wide pedestrian space, split between 5-foot-wide amenity space and a 5-foot-wide sidewalk, on the west side of US 259 and a 10-foot-wide shared use path on the east side of the corridor; the pedestrian space is assumed to be limited to a 5-foot-wide sidewalk. The calculated benefits are based on the additional person-miles from users in the project area using the improved facilities. The economic value per person-mile for the proposed pedestrian infrastructure is \$0.11 per person-mile generated by the Project above baseline conditions. The "rule of half" was applied to the value of the miles from the induced person-trips, per U.S. DOT BCA guidance.

Table 8: Economic Value of Induced Person-Miles by Pedestrians in US 259 Corridor

	Increase in Annual Person-Miles 2028 2047		Value of Pedestrian Facility Benefits (2023\$)	
			2028	2047
Pedestrian Facility Benefits by Year	45,600	45,600	\$36,000	\$36,000

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of pedestrian facility benefits is calculated to be \$0.7 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of pedestrian facility benefits is calculated to be \$0.5 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 9 summarizes the monetized value of facility amenities for pedestrians.

Table 9: Pedestrian Facility Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$721,000	\$470,000

4.2.3 Bicycle Facility Benefits

The analysis calculates the facility benefits related to the proposed improvements for the US 259 corridor by applying the standardized economic value per person-mile for a "Cycling Path with At-Grade Crossing", respectively, based on the definitions for bicyclist infrastructure in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. The analysis assumes the baseline condition of the existing infrastructure includes on-street travel on US 259 without improvements for bicyclists. The calculated benefits are based on the additional person-miles from new users in the project area using the improved facilities. The economic value per person-mile for the proposed bicycle infrastructure is \$1.70 ("Cycling Path with At-Grade Crossings") per person-mile generated by the Project above baseline conditions. The "rule of half" was applied to the value of the miles from the induced bike-trips, per U.S. DOT BCA guidance.

Table 10: Economic Value of Increase in Person-Miles by Bicyclists in Project Area

	Total Person-Miles		Value of Bicycle Facility Benefits (2023\$)	
	2028	2047	2028	2047
Bicycle Facility Benefits by Year	153,000	153,000	\$197,000	\$197,000

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of bicycle facility benefits is calculated to be \$3.9 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value

of bicycle facility benefits is calculated to be \$2.6 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 11 summarizes the monetized value of facility amenities for bicyclists.

Table 11: Bicyclist Facility Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$3,931,000	\$2,564,000

4.2.4 Bicycle and Pedestrian Health Benefits

The analysis calculates the health benefits related to the proposed improvements in the US 259 corridor by applying the standardized economic value per induced person-trip for pedestrians and bicyclists between the ages of 20 to 64, based on the definitions in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. The projections of pedestrians and bicyclists break out future induced trips by adults and children, allowing for the calculation of the reduced mortality risk for users within the project area. The standardized value of the health benefits is defined at \$7.18 per person-trip for adult bicyclists and \$8.06 per person-trip for adult pedestrians.

Table 12: Economic Value of Health Benefits for Pedestrians and Bicyclists in Project Area

	Induced Person-Trips		Value of Hea (202	
	2028	2047	2028	2047
Adult Bicyclists	41,500	41,500	\$176,000	\$176,000
Adult Pedestrians	53,000	53,000	\$290,000	\$290,000
Total	94,500	94,500	\$466,000	\$466,000

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of pedestrian and bicyclist health benefits is calculated to be \$9.3 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of pedestrian and bicyclist health benefits is calculated to be \$6.1 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 13 summarizes the monetized value of pedestrian and bicyclist health benefits.

Table 13: Pedestrian and Bicyclist Health Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Bicyclist Health Benefits	\$3,518,000	\$2,295,000
Pedestrian Health Benefits	\$5,808,000	\$3,789,000
Total Benefits	\$9,326,000	\$6,083,000

4.2.5 Bicyclist Travel Time Savings

The analysis calculates the travel time savings for bicyclists benefitting from the improvement in traffic conditions in the project area, based on the difference in average travel speed between an on-street facility (9.8 MPH) and an off-street facility without crossings (12.1 MPH). The analysis assumes the baseline condition of the projected existing bicycle-trips without the proposed improvements. The calculated benefits are based on the reduced delay for existing bicyclists using the improved infrastructure facility. The economic value per person-hour of travel by bicyclists is \$38.80 per hour, in accordance with U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. Induced bicycle-trips are not included in the calculation of the travel time savings.

Table 14: Assumptions about Conditions for Bicyclists in Project Area

	2028	2047
Annual Existing Bicycle-Trips in Project Area	43,500	43,500
Annual Avoided Person-Hours of Delay	1,100	1,100

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of travel time savings for bicyclists is calculated to be \$0.9 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and a real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present

value of travel time savings for bicyclists is calculated to be \$0.6 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 15 summarizes the monetized value of travel time savings for bicyclists.

Table 15: Bicyclist Travel Time Savings Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$866,000	\$565,000

4.3 Reduction in Crashes Involving Roadway Vehicles

The analysis calculates the reduction in crashes involving roadway vehicles related to the proposed project improvements in the project area by applying the appropriate crash modification factor to the historical average crashes in the project area, based on crash history from 2014 to 2023 organized by location, crash severity and mode of travel. Based on the characteristics of the project improvements, a percentage of crashes involving roadway vehicles in the project area are expected to be avoided in the future. The detailed crash data for the project area is provided in the tab labeled "Collision Data" in the BCA model spreadsheet file. Given the characteristics of improvements in each segment, the following crash modification factors were assigned to crashes within each project segment:

- Install lighting (CMF ID: 7776) 32% reduction in crashes; and,
- Install TWLTL (two-way left turn lane) on rural two-lane roads (CMF ID: 583) 36% reduction in crashes

The crash modification factors reflect the proposed changes in roadway geometry within each project segment. The installation of traffic signals and left-turn lanes would reduce the risk of crashes during turning movements and intersection movements. The summary of crash data by collision severity is shown in the "Crash Data Summary" tab of the BCA model spreadsheet file; crashes are attributed to whether they would benefit from the street lighting or the TWLTL to avoid double-counting. The number of crashes by collision severity are shown below in Table 16.

Table 16: Crash History for Vehicles in Project Area (2012 to 2021)

Crash Severity	Number of Crashes	Annual Average	Annual Avoided Crashes
No Injury	111	11.1	3.8
Possible Injury	48	4.8	1.6
Non-Incapacitating Injury	15	1.5	0.5
Incapacitating Injury	9	0.9	0.3
Fatality	5	0.5	0.2
Injury Severity Unknown	0	-	-
Total	108	10.8	6.4

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of avoided crashes involving roadway vehicles is calculated to be \$60.1 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of avoided crashes involving roadway vehicles is calculated to be \$39.2 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 17 summarizes the monetized value of avoided injuries from crashes involving roadway vehicles.

Table 17: Value of Avoided Crashes Involving Roadway Vehicles (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$60,075,000	\$39,188,000

4.4 Auto and Truck Traffic Benefits

With the proposed improvements in the roadway geometry, auto and truck traffic in the project area are expected to experience improved traffic conditions during the peak periods, as compared to the No Build conditions. Traffic count data was collected at two sites on US 259 near Hochatown; the traffic count data included daily totals from

July 2022 to January 2024 and hourly totals from July 11 to July 25. The daily traffic count data illustrated the traffic volumes during the week (Monday to Thursday) relative to higher volumes on the weekend (Friday to Sunday); similarly, average daily traffic volumes are higher during the summer season compared to the off-season months. The hourly traffic count illustrates the differences in the distribution of traffic by hour during the week and on the weekend.

Due to the impact of visitor traffic on roadway conditions in Hochatown, the analysis evaluated the impacts of the proposed project improvements on traffic conditions during these distinct periods. These considerations specifically affect the volume/capacity ratio of the roadway under No Build and Build conditions, resulting in differences in the average travel speed for roadway vehicles. Based on these assumptions, the analysis calculates the vehicle-hours traveled for auto and truck traffic under the No Build and Build conditions. In the BCA model spreadsheet file, a detailed summary of the traffic data is provided in the "Traffic Data Summary" tab and the calculations of the traffic impacts are provided in the "Traffic Data Inputs" tab.

Table 18: Projected Annual Vehicle-Hours Traveled in Project Area

	No Build		Build	
	2028	2047	2028	2047
Vehicle-Hours Traveled (Auto)	340,500	680,100	333,100	588,800
Vehicle-Hours Traveled (Trucks)	31,600	63,200	27,300	48,100
Vehicle-Hours Traveled (Total)	372,100	743,200	360,400	637,000

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of auto and truck travel time savings is calculated to be \$33.5 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of vehicle travel time savings is calculated to be \$19.8 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 19 summarizes the monetized value of auto and truck travel time savings.

Table 19: Value of Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Travel Time Savings for Autos	\$27,102,000	\$15,861,000
Travel Time Savings for Trucks	\$6,373,000	\$3,898,000
Total Benefits	\$33,475,000	\$19,760,000

4.4.1 Vehicle Emissions Reduction

The analysis calculates the reduction in vehicle emissions related to the proposed project improvements by applying emissions factors per vehicle-mile traveled and the standardized economic values per metric ton of emissions gas, as defined in the U.S. DOT BCA guidance documents. The emissions factors per vehicle-mile vary by emissions type and the standardized social costs of vehicle emissions vary by year.

Table 20: Avoided Vehicle Emissions in Project Area (in metric tons)

	Avoided Emissions over 20-Year Analysis Period
Emissions – NOx	2.118
Emissions - PM _{2.5}	(0.036)
Emissions – SOx	(0.026)
Emissions - CO ₂	2,681

Over the 20-year analysis period, the total value of avoided vehicle emissions is calculated to be \$0.9 million in undiscounted 2023 dollars. Assuming a base year of 2023 and real discount rate of 3.1 percent, the net present value of avoided vehicle emissions is calculated to be \$0.5 million in discounted 2023 dollars. Table 21 summarizes the monetized value of avoided vehicle emissions.

Table 21: Avoided Vehicle Emissions Benefits (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Total Benefits	\$860,000	\$488,000

4.5 Residual Value

The residual value is calculated by determining the percentage of useful life remaining beyond the analysis period and multiplying that percentage by the construction cost for that component. With a 20-year analysis period and an estimated 30-year design life for the improvements in the project area, the residual value is 33% of the initial cost using the straight-line depreciation method. The remaining capital value is viewed as a cost offset or "negative cost" and is applied to the last year of analysis period as a benefit. The residual value of \$19.7 million is discounted back to \$9.4 million in discounted 2023 dollars.

Table 22: Residual Value (in 2023 dollars)

	Monetized Value (undiscounted)	Monetized Value (discounted)
Residual Value	\$19,654,000	\$9,446,000

5. Benefit-Cost Analysis Results

5.1 Evaluation Measures

The BCA converts potential gains (benefits) and losses (costs) with the Project into monetary units and compares them. The following common benefit-cost evaluation measures are included in this BCA:

- Net Present Value (NPV): NPV compares the net benefits (benefits minus costs) after being discounted to present values using the real discount rate assumption. The NPV provides a perspective on the overall dollar magnitude of cash flows over time in today's dollar terms.
- Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR): The evaluation also estimates the benefit-cost ratio; the present value of incremental benefits is divided by the present value of incremental costs to yield the benefit-cost ratio. The BCR expresses the relation of discounted benefits to discounted costs as a measure of the extent to which a project's benefits either exceed or fall short of the costs.
- Internal Rate of Return (IRR): The IRR is the discount rate which makes the NPV from the Project equal to zero. In other words, it is the discount rate at which the Project breaks even. Generally, the greater the IRR, the more desirable the Project.

5.2 BCA Results

The summary of the benefit-cost analysis is outlined in the table below. The results are in constant 2023 dollars discounted at 3.1 percent, as prescribed by the U.S. DOT BCA Guidance documents; the value of CO₂ emissions are discounted at 2 percent. All benefits and costs are calculated in constant 2023 dollars over an evaluation period extending 20 years after the end of construction. The total benefits from the project improvements within the analysis period are calculated to be \$71.1 million in discounted 2023 dollars. The total capital costs, including environmental planning, preliminary engineering, design and construction, are calculated to be \$55.1 million in discounted 2023 dollars. The difference of the discounted benefits and costs equal a net present value of \$16.0 million in discounted 2023 dollars, resulting in a benefit-cost ratio (BCR) of 1.39. The internal rate of return for the project is 5.4 percent.

Table 23: Summary of Benefit-Cost Analysis (in 2023 dollars)

BCA Metric	Monetized Value	
	Undiscounted	Discounted
Total Benefits	\$117,394,000	\$71,053,000
Bicycle and Pedestrian Safety and Facility Benefits	\$4,929,000	\$3,215,000

Hochatown Community Access and Pedestrian Safety Project: Benefit-Cost Analysis Narrative

BCA Metric	Monetized Value		
	Undiscounted	Discounted	
Bicycle and Pedestrian Health Benefits	\$9,326,000	\$6,083,000	
Bicycle Travel Time Savings	\$866,000	\$565,000	
Reduction in Roadway Crashes	\$60,075,000	\$39,188,000	
Auto and Truck Travel Time Savings	\$33,475,000	\$19,760,000	
Vehicle Emissions Reduction	\$860,000	\$488,000	
Residual Value	\$19,654,000	\$9,446,000	
Change in O&M Costs	(\$11,792,000)	(\$7,692,000)	
Total Capital Costs	\$60,839,000	\$55,075,000	
Net Present Value	\$56,555,000	\$15,978,000	
Benefit-Cost Ratio	1.93	1.29	
Internal Rate of Return	5.3%		