

Minutes
Historical Preservation and Landmark Board of Review
Virtual Special Meeting
Aug. 6, 2020, 4:00 p.m.
WebEx, Virtual Special Meeting

A meeting notice had been given and an agenda was posted in accordance with the Open Meeting Act.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Sharon Astrin
Kassy Malone
Mike Mays
Susan McCalmont
Dr. Andreana Prichard
Laura Stone

MEMBERS ABSENT: Don Davis
Carla Splaingard

STAFF/GUESTS: Casey Jones, AICP, OMES, Planner
Beverly Hicks, OMES, Planning/Administrative Coordinator
Fran Patton, Applicant
David M. Box, Applicant representative
Tim Ross, Applicant
Ryan Brown, Applicant representative
Nash Thomas, Applicant
Austin Tunnell, Applicant
Luke Richardson, Applicant
Bob Burton, Guest
Frank V. Roesler III, ODOT Virtual Meetings
Corbi Jenkins, ODOT VM
Bart Vleugels, ODOT VM
Sieana Mackiewicz, ODOT VM
Kim Bleeker, ODOT VM

A. Roll Call:

Chairwoman Laura Stone called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m. A roll call was taken and a quorum was established. Ms. Stone was advised that notice of the meeting had been given and an agenda posted in accordance with the Open Meeting Act.

B. Minutes:

1. Approval, disapproval or amendment of the minutes of the July 2, 2020, Virtual Special meeting:

Andreana Prichard moved to approve the special meeting minutes of July. Susan McCalmont seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

C. **Special Public Hearings:** None.

D. **Rezoning Requests:** None.

E. **Certificates of Appropriateness:**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-20-46, request by Fran Patton, representing Church of the Living God, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 947-949 East Drive in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:**

- a. Item 1, demolish a detached garage/storage building.

Staff recommended to approve the demolition of garage/storage building with the following findings:

- a. The structure is in a state of disrepair and requires extensive work.
- b. Most of the structure's historic fabric has already been lost due to past alterations and deterioration over time.
- c. While demolition of the structure will damage the integrity and continuity of the district, repairing the structure would result in the loss of the structure's remaining historic fabric.

Susan McCalmont moved to approve the staff recommendation. Andreana Prichard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-20-36, request by David M. Box, Williams, Box, Forshee & Bullard, representing Bad Apple Equities, LLC, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 922 NE 17th Street in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:**

- a. Item 1, demolition of a detached garage.

Staff recommended to approve Item 1, with the following findings:

Findings:

- a. The structure is in a state of disrepair and requires extensive work.
- b. Most of the structure's historic fabric has already been lost due to past alterations and deterioration over time.
- c. While demolition of the structure will damage the integrity and continuity of the district, repairing the structure would result in the loss of the structure's remaining historic fabric.

Sharon Astrin moved to approve Item 1. Kassy Malone seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

b. Item 2, construction of a single family dwelling and detached garage.

Staff recommended to approve Item 2, as submitted, with the following findings and conditions:

Findings:

- a. The proposed work is designed to be compatible with surrounding structures and will not have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the district.

Recommended conditions:

- a. The dwelling shall comply with the 35-foot front yard platted setback.
- b. Exterior brick shall not be painted.
- c. All exterior shall conform to the approved site plan, architectural elevation drawings, and exterior material specifications. Changes to the approved plans must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.
- d. New concrete shall not be bright white in color. Color-matching the concrete to older, existing concrete is encouraged.

Susan McCalmont moved to approve Item 2 with conditions. Andreana Prichard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

Mr. Mays entered the meeting at 4:14 p.m.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-20-47, request by Ryan Brown, UBuildIt, representing 429 NE 15th LLC, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 429 NE 15th Street in the Wilson-Harn Historic District of Oklahoma City:

a. Item 1, demolition of a single family dwelling and storage shed.

Staff recommended to approve Item 1, with the following findings:

Findings:

- a. The structure is in a state of disrepair and requires extensive work.
- b. While demolition of the structure will damage the integrity and continuity of the district, repairing the structure could result in the loss of the structure's historic fabric.

Susan McCalmont moved to table this item to the next meeting and request that the applicant provide photos of the interior and a report from a structural engineer. Andreana Prichard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

b. Item 2, construction of a single family dwelling, detached garage, driveway and fence.

Andreana Prichard moved to table this item to the next meeting. Kassy Malone seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-21-4, request by Austin Tunnell, representing Vitruvius Properties, LLC, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 706 NE 19th Street in the Capitol-Lincoln Terrace Historic District of Oklahoma City:

- a. Item 1, construction of a detached garage.
- b. Item 2, removal of concrete driveway and installation of new concrete driveway.

Staff recommended to approve Item 1 and 2, with the following findings and conditions:

Findings:

- a. The proposed garage has a modest design and is compatible yet differentiated from the original garage and from the existing home so as not to convey a false sense of historical development.
- b. The location, building footprint, scale, orientation, design and exterior materials of the proposed garage are compatible with the property's setting and with buildings on surrounding properties.
- c. The proposed garage and driveway will not have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the district or the property.

Recommended conditions:

- a. All exterior work shall conform to the approved site plan, architectural elevation drawings, and exterior material specifications. Changes to the approved plans must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.
- b. New concrete shall not be bright white in color. Color-matching the concrete to older, existing concrete is encouraged.

Mr. Jones reported that there was a typo in the staff report on the location of the garage windows. The windows will be located on the west and south elevations of the garage.

Sharon Astrin moved to approve Items 1 and 2. Mike Mays seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

5. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-21-5, request by Luke Richardson, representing Triple H Investments, LLC, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 943-945 NE 16th Street in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:

Mr. Jones reported this case came to staff as a zoning violation, due to exterior work being done to the property without a Certificate of Appropriateness and building permit from the Commission. This was referred to staff after a complaint was submitted to the City Code Enforcement staff.

Mr. Richardson contacted staff after he received a notice from the City. He submitted a CA application and is requesting approval for the work that has already been completed.

Item 1, exterior alterations to the **south elevation** (front) of the home:

- i. Removal of two 6-over-1 wood windows, and replacement with PlyGem 1-over-1 aluminum windows to fit the existing openings.
- a. Item 2, exterior alterations to the **east elevation** (street side) of the home:
 - i. Removal of 6-over-1 wood windows, and replacement with PlyGem 1-over-1 aluminum windows to fit the existing openings.
 - ii. Removal of plywood siding from one window opening and removal of an 8-over-8 aluminum window and plywood siding from a second window opening on the east on the east elevation near the rear of the home, removal of brick from the wall between two openings to create a single larger opening, and installation of fiber cement board lap siding with false woodgrain texture in the opening.
 - iii. Removal of brick from the exterior wall between two windows under the gable on the east elevation and replacement with fiber cement board lap siding with false woodgrain texture.
- b. Item 3, exterior alterations to the **north elevation** (rear) of the home:
 - i. Removal of 8-over-8 aluminum windows and plywood siding from two window openings, and replacement with 1-over-1 aluminum windows and fiber cement board lap siding with false woodgrain texture.
- c. Item 4, exterior alterations to the **west elevation** (interior side) of the home:
 - i. Removal of six 6-over-1 wood windows, and replacement with PlyGem 1-over-1 aluminum windows to fit the existing opening.
 - ii. Removal of 8-over-8 aluminum window and plywood siding from one window opening, and replacement with a 1-over-1 aluminum window and fiber cement board lap siding with false woodgrain texture.
- d. Item 5, **driveway alterations**:
 - i. Enlargement of the concrete driveway and off-street parking pad to the north of the home to provide five off-street parking spaces.

Staff recommended to deny all items 1 through 5, as submitted, with the following findings and recommendations:

Findings:

- a. The proposed work is not designed to be compatible with the existing structure or with surrounding structures and will have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the property and the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District.
- b. The proposed windows are not compatible with the materials, dimensions, profile and appearance of the original historic wood windows, the proposed windows are not

designed to fit the historic window openings, and the proposed work is inconsistent with the Commission's *Historic Preservation Standards and Guidelines*.

- c. The proposed alterations of window openings on prominent elevations, including removal of brick and installation of siding, is in consistent with the Commission's *Historic Preservation Standards and Guidelines*.
- d. The proposed expanded driveway and parking area is sited appropriately at the rear of the property but has bright white concrete and no proposed screening or landscaping to soften the view of the additional pavement from Kelley Avenue.
- e. The proposed work, rather than correcting past inappropriate alterations, will result in additional alterations and loss to the structure's historic fabric and damage to the property's historic setting.

Recommendations:

- a. Submit a revised Certificate of Appropriateness application to Commission staff with proposed alterations that preserve the historic integrity and character of the home and grounds and comply with the Commission's *Historic Preservation Standards and Guidelines*.

Sharon Astrin moved to deny items 1 through 5 in their entirety, per staff recommendation. Andreana Prichard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

F. Miscellaneous: None.

G. Reports and Communications:

- Reappointment of Susan McCalmont

Mr. Jones reported that Ms. McCalmont was reappointed by the Zoning Commission at their July 24, 2020 meeting to serve another three-year term on the Historical Preservation and Landmark Board of Review.

H. Adjournment:

There being no further business, Susan McCalmont motioned to adjourn. Sharon Astrin seconded the motion. Seeing no opposition, the meeting adjourned at 5:17 p.m.