## **Minutes**

# Historical Preservation and Landmark Board of Review Regular Meeting Will Rogers Building

will Rogers Building

**CR – 214 (Innovate) /216 (Create)** 

2401 N. Lincoln Boulevard, Oklahoma City, OK 73105 Jan. 6, 2022, 4:00 p.m.

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Laura Stone

Mike Mays Josh Greenhaw Kassy Malone Susan McCalmont Camal Pennington Carla Splaingard

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** Janis Powers

**STAFF/GUESTS:** Casey Jones, AICP, OMES, Planner

Beverly Hicks, OMES, Planning/Administrative Coordinator

Andrew Johnson, Guest Paige Jones, Guest Patrick Struble, Guest Zenephon Warrior, CWNR Clay & Becky Taylor, Guest Cheryl Pennington, Guest

## A. Roll Call:

Chair, Laura Stone called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. A roll call was taken and a quorum was established. Ms. Stone was advised that notice of the meeting had been given and an agenda posted in accordance with the Open Meeting Act.

# **B.** Minutes:

# 1. Approval, disapproval or amendment of the minutes of the Nov. 4, 2021, special meeting:

Mike Mays moved to approve the meeting minutes of November. Camal Pennington seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

- C. Special Public Hearings: None.
- D. Rezoning Requests: None.

## E. Certificates of Appropriateness:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-21-22-29, request by Andrew Johnson and Paige Jones for a certificate of appropriateness for demolition of a detached garage with a second story apartment at 911 NE 16<sup>th</sup> Street (Parcel address: 913 NE 16<sup>th</sup> Street) in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:

On August 5, 2021, the Board denied the applicant's previous request (CA-21-22-2) for demolition and advised that the following documentation must be provided should the applicant reapply:

- 1. An explanation of the reasons for demolishing rather than repairing the structure.
- 2. Photographs of all existing structural damage, particularly on the interior of the structure; and
- 3. A licensed engineer's structural inspection report on the condition of the structure and feasibility of repairs.

On November 30, 2021, the applicant submitted a new application (CA-21-22-29) together with an engineer's visual inspection results containing the engineer's photographs and recommendations.

Based on the application and supporting documents provided, staff recommended to approve CA-21-22-29, request for a certificate of appropriateness for demolition of the two-story garage, with the following findings:

- 1. While demolition of the structure would damage the integrity and continuity of the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District, the work that would be necessary to repair and rehabilitate the structure would likely result in the loss of much of the structure's historic fabric.
- 2. The structural integrity of the structure is compromised, and extensive work would be necessary to correct deficiencies and repair the structure to a safe and code-compliant condition.
- 3. Repairing the structure would be economically unfeasible.

Mike Mays moved to approve CA-21-22-29. Josh Greenhaw seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;

Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

Mr. Greenhaw entered the meeting at 4:04 p.m.

# 2. <u>Discussion and possible action regarding CA-21-22-23, request by Cheryl Pennington for a certificate of appropriateness for demolition of a detached garage at 709 NE 20<sup>th</sup> Street in the Capitol-Lincoln Terrace Historic District of Oklahoma City:</u>

The garage provides historical context and character to the Capitol-Lincoln Terrace Historic District, However, the existing damage to the garage is so extensive that repair would not be possible without completely reconstructing most of the garage.

Staff recommended to approve CA-21-22-23, certificate of appropriateness for demolition of the garage, with the following findings:

- 1. Existing structural problems that are visibly apparent include:
  - a. Large cracks in the concrete slab foundation;
  - b. Settling of the foundation and walls;
  - c. Multiple large cracks in exterior wall;
  - d. Bowing and separation of brick from exterior walls;

- e. Partial collapse of exterior brick walls; all exterior and interior walls are leaning and are not plumb.
- 2. The existing structure cannot be repaired and made structurally sound without completely rebuilding the structure, including its foundation, walls soffit, and doors. This would result in considerable loss of the building's historic fabric, even if the existing brick were salvaged and reused.

Josh Greenhaw moved to approve CA-21-22-23. Mike Mays seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;

Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

Mr. Pennington recused himself due to a conflict of interest.

3. <u>Discussion and possible action regarding CA-21-22-30</u>, request by Patrick Struble for a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alterations to the west and south elevations of the home, including the closing of a side entry door opening, removal of rear windows and rear bay window projection; installation of several new rear windows and installation of rear exterior doors at 616 NE 15<sup>th</sup> Street in the Capitol-Lincoln Terrace Historic District.

To accommodate interior remodeling and renovations, the applicant proposes to alter the exterior of the home as follows:

- 1. <u>West elevation</u>: Convert side entry door in laundry room into a non-functioning, decorative door with a walled-in opening (to accommodate interior remodeling).
- 2. <u>South elevation</u>: Remove two square windows from laundry room; install a rectangular single hung window centered on the south wall of the laundry room, and fill gaps from original window openings with brick.
- 3. <u>South elevation</u>: Remove square window from east wall of laundry room, and install a new entry door there.
- 4. <u>South elevation between laundry room and one-story wing</u>: Remove five windows and bay window projection on ground floor; convert rear wall to a linear brick wall; install three new windows; install new French doors with sidelights with or without a transom window above; and fill any gaps with brick.

#### Staff Discussion and Recommendations:

The west (side) elevation would appear unchanged from the street, as the laundry room door would be retained for appearance rather than function. The door adds character and visual interest to the public's view of the home and should be retained.

The proposed alterations to the south (rear) elevation would not be visible to the public and would not impact the visual character of the historic district. In projects involving rehabilitation and alterations to improve function and use, work on the rear of a home is typically offered greater flexibility particularly when the area is private and cannot be viewed by the general public.

Staff recommended to approve CA-21-22-30, certificate of appropriateness for exterior alterations to the south and west elevations of the home, with the following finding and conditions:

## Finding:

a. The proposed work is designed to be compatible with the home and with surround properties wand will not adversely affect the integrity and historic character of the district or the property.

## Conditions:

- a. The new windows must be made of wood or aluminum-clad wood and must have 6-over-6 simulated divided lights with muntins affixed to the exterior and interior glass and with spacer bars between the glass panes.
- b. The exterior doors must be made of wood or aluminum-clad wood in a 15-lite pattern or other patterns as may be approved.
- c. Historic exterior brick must be saved and reused on the rear wall, and mortar of compatible color and composition must be used.
- d. All exterior work shall conform to the approved plans and exterior material specifications. Any proposed changes must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.
- e. A building permit shall be obtained from the City of Oklahoma City prior to the commencement of work.

The board considered each of the following requests in order:

1. <u>West elevation</u>: Convert side entry door in laundry room into a non-functioning, decorative door with a walled-in opening (to accommodate interior remodeling).

Josh Greenhaw moved to approve request one on the west elevation. Camal Pennington seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;

Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

2. <u>South elevation</u>: Remove two square windows from laundry room; install a rectangular single hung window centered on the south wall of the laundry room, and fill gaps from original window openings with brick.

Josh Greenhaw moved to approve request number two. Carla Splaingard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion failed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, no; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, no;

Mr. Pennington, no; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, no.

3. <u>South elevation</u>: Remove square window from east wall of laundry room, and install a new entry door there.

Josh Greenhaw moved to approve request three. Mike Mays seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;

Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

4. <u>South elevation between laundry room and one-story wing</u>: Remove five windows and bay window projection on ground floor; convert rear wall to a linear brick wall; install three

new windows; install new French doors with sidelights with or without a transom window above; and fill any gaps with brick.

Josh Greenhaw moved to approve request four, with the condition that the removal of the five windows, the bay window and the conversion to linear brick wall not be done. (Approve removal of one window and replacement with French doors and sidelights centered below the existing window above). Mike Mays seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;

Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-21-22-21, request by Clay and Becky Taylor for removal of the brick wall in the rear yard and salvaging of the brick for use on a second story addition; construction of a capped wood fence in the rear yard; removal of the brick and concrete stairway on the north elevation of the home and salvaging of the brick for use on a second story addition; construction of a second story addition onto the east elevation of the home within the existing building footprint; replacement of steel casement windows with aluminum clad wood casement windows; and construction of a covered, unenclosed patio addition onto the north elevation of the home at 745 NE 18<sup>th</sup> Street in the Capitol-Lincoln Terrace Historic District of Oklahoma City.

The Board reviewed the applicant's conceptual plans for the proposed work on November 4, 2021, and tabled the request to allow time for the applicant to provide a more detailed set of plans, including a site plan, floor plan, architectural elevation drawings, and exterior material specifications. On December 27, 2021, the applicant submitted the attached, revised plans, photographs, and window information for the Board's consideration.

Staff recommended to approve CA-21-22-21, certificate of appropriateness for all listed work items, with the following finding and conditions:

#### Finding:

a. The proposed work is designed to be compatible with the home and with surround properties and will not adversely affect the integrity and historic character of the district or the property.

## Conditions:

- a. The new windows must be made of aluminum-clad wood and must have simulated divided lights with muntins affixed to the exterior and interior glass and with spacer bars between the glass panes.
- b. On the second story addition, the color and composition of the brick and mortar used on the exterior walls must be compatible with the brick and mortar on the existing home.
- c. All exterior work shall conform to the approved plans and exterior material specifications. Any proposed changes must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.
- d. A building permit shall be obtained from the City of Oklahoma City prior to the commencement of work.

Carla Splaingard moved to approve CA-21-22-21. Josh Greenhaw seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

- Mr. Greenhaw, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes;
- Mr. Pennington, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.
- F. Miscellaneous: None.
- **G. Reports and Communications:** None.

# H. Adjournment:

There being no further business, Joshua Greenhaw motioned to adjourn. Mike Mays seconded the motion. Seeing no opposition, the meeting adjourned at 4:55 p.m.